# The Birth of Pragmatic Solidarity in Spain: Contesting Centuries of Power and Distance

## Víctor Lara Bermejo \*

Department of Spanish, Universidad de Cádiz, Spain

Received on: 14-3-2021 Accepted on: 7-10-2021

#### **Abstract**

The use of informal pronouns of address in virtually any context in current Spain is a trend that has been related to the establishment of democracy. However, latest research points out that the fashion for solidarity commenced more than two hundred years ago. In this paper, I aim to account for the opinions and attitudes of the 18<sup>th</sup>- and 19<sup>th</sup>-century Spanish press in order to find the geographical and social origins of this fact, as well as the reaction of the different media, based on their prevailing ideology. The results show that the tendency towards solidarity comes from France and is promoted by the upper urban class, though it is vehemently contested by the conservative spectrum of society.

Keywords: Forms of Address, Solidarity, Tuteo, Spanish, Attitudes in Press.

#### 1. Introduction and state of the art

Current standard Peninsular Spanish exhibits a symmetrical paradigm with regards to its pronouns of address, since it possesses a different pronoun for each grammatical number and degree of politeness (table 1, based on Fontanella de Weinberg 1999).

Table 1: Pronouns of address and agreement in standard Peninsular Spanish

	Singular	Plural
Informality	$T\acute{u} + 2sg$	Vosotros + 2pl
Formality	Usted + 3sg	Ustedes + 3pl

As table 1 shows, each form induces an own agreement, but roughly speaking, the third person inflection works as formal or distant whereas the second person inflection emerges for informal, intimate or solidary contexts. This linguistic behaviour is quite rare cross-linguistically, according to Siewierska (2004), because most languages only foresee a single pronoun to address a group of people, which can also be used every now and then to address an individual in a formal situation. This paradigm can be attested in French, by means of *vous*, and existed in Medieval Spanish too.

However, the arising of formal pronouns is less and less frequent in Spain, favouring the so-called *tuteo* (the employment of  $t\acute{u}$ ) in virtually any context. This *tuteo* is also visible in plural, since the emergence of *vosotros* is much more frequent than that of *ustedes*. The spread of *tuteo* over contexts

<sup>© 2023</sup> JJMLL Publishers/Yarmouk University. All Rights Reserved,

<sup>\*</sup> Doi: https://doi.org/ 10.47012/jjmll.15.2.2

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding Author: victor.lara@gm.uca.es

This article is part of the project titled "Política, ideologías y actitudes lingüísticas en la España y América de los siglos XVIII y XIX: un acercamiento desde los textos periodísticos y gramaticales (ref. PID2020-115226GB-100)

previously foreseen by *usted(es)* has been repeatedly pointed out in the literature. For instance, Alonso (1962) stated that *tuteo* was fast gaining ground over *usted* in the middle of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. De Jonge and Nieuwenhuijsen (2012) affirm that the increase of *tuteo* is a fashion whose origin dates back in the reinstauration of democracy in 1975. Recently, García Godoy (2010) and Molina Martos (2020) have found that *tuteo* commences in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century and the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, but these authors only focus on the singular number. In plural, informal *vosotros* starts diffusing over *ustedes* in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century and the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, though unevenly. According to Fernández Martín (2012) and Lara Bermejo (2022), *vosotros* extends first throughout the northern and central part of Spain, but hardly reaches the south.

The literature has disregarded the study of Peninsular Spanish that dates back to the 1700's and 1800's although these centuries represent a profound change in the evolution of this language. As for pragmatics, this shift does not only affect Spanish, but also any language in Europe. Hickey (2003), Faraco (1996), Fernández Martín (2012), Raumolin-Brunberg (2005) or Brown and Gilman (1960) have demonstrated that it was in a certain period of the 18th century when address paradigms began to change throughout Europe, establishing themselves in the 1800's. Even the American varieties of Spanish and Portuguese exhibit profound changes to this respect (especially in the nineteenth century), that end up establishing themselves in the twentieth century (Abadía de Quant 1992; Lopes and Cavalcante 2011). Secondly, Melis et al. (2003) and Company Company (2012) affirm that Spanish undergoes a third evolutionary period that begins in the 18th century, goes on in the 19th century and ends up being imposed in the 1900's. In addition, in the case of Spain, the eighteenth century represents a radical change in its inner policy, since the house of Austria is defeated by that of the Bourbons. The arrival of this royal house meant the emergence of France as the focus of prestige for Spaniards, after so many years in which Spain was the prestigious pattern within its borders.

The findings I have referred to suggest that the increase of *tuteo* was not accepted immediately in the Spanish society. Though epistolary, juridical and literary texts have been analysed and have been the source for the conclusions of the abovementioned authors, we lack information about the actual attitudes of the Spanish society in the years where this fashion started to take place. As a result, I aim to study the attitudes and opinions about *tuteo* during the centuries where it is said to have diffused both in plural and in singular.

Furthermore, the importance of showing an attitudinal or perceptual approach, according to Preston (1999), is subject to the fact that it is possible to study the reactions of society towards linguistic phenomena and how these attitudes also shape these same changes. In this way, not only can the directionality of the change be attested, but also the attitude and positioning that the different social spectra had with respect to it. In the case of the press, the relevance underlies the fact that it is an echo of political parties, ideologies and, therefore, it usually expresses opinions about issues that have to do precisely with political and social relations.

Consequently, in 2, I will present the corpus and methodology I have applied; in 3, I will show the results; in 4, I will discuss and analyse the data I will supply; in 5, I will summarise the conclusions of this research and, in 6, I will list the references I have consulted.

# 2. Corpus and methodology

With the aim of providing data that account for the linguistic attitudes of the period between 1700 and 1900, I have extracted occurrences of the Spanish press available on the website of the Hemeroteca Nacional Española (Spanish National Newspaper Library), HNE after its acronym. Examples of all types of journalistic genre that were edited and disseminated in Spain in those years have been obtained and the search has been carried out using in the search engine keywords that had to do with *tuteo* or the pronoun *vosotros*. Nevertheless, no opinion has been found regarding the plural pronoun. Below, I list the newspapers where any opinion or attitude about *tuteo* has arisen.

```
Diario Constitucional de Palma (1839-1851).
El Álbum Ibero-Americano (1891-1909).
El Clamor Público (1844-1864).
El Constitucional (1837-1843).
El Correo de Madrid (1786 – 1791).
El Corresponsal (1839-1844).
El Eco del Comercio (1834-1849).
El Español (1835-1848).
El Espectador (1841-1848).
El Heraldo (1842-1854).
El Liberal (1879-1939).
El Procurador General de la Nación y del Rey (1812 - 1824).
El Restaurador (1823-1824).
La Corona (1857-1868).
La Esperanza (1844-1874).
La Guirnalda (1867-1883).
La Hormiga de Oro (1884-1936).
La Lidia (1882-1927).
La Nación (1849-1873).
Museo de las Familias (1843-1870).
```

Revista de España (1868-1894).

Semanario Pintoresco Español (1836-1857).

The occurrences I will depict in this paper will be analysed, by also taking into account the ideological profile of the newspaper where they were published, the section where they appeared as well as the date. This will also result in the analysis and discussion of the variables that have influenced on the increase of *tuteo*, specifically, the following: the pragmatic aspects that conditioned it, the social variables that affected its diffusion as well as the geographical origin of this fashion. Moreover, I will verify whether the results are analogous to others elsewhere at that time, and whether the theories about politeness can explain them.

It is necessary to underlie the fact that this study is founded on qualitative analyses, because of the nature of the topic and the source. Newspapers usually disseminate news and, in most of them, some opinions. Nevertheless, finding opinions about *tuteo* is not very frequent, for it was not a phenomenon that happened all of a sudden, but, as will be demonstrated below, gradually. Consequently, the results will have to be read, taking into account these constraints, and bearing always in mind that the goal of this paper is to discover the attitudes that the Spanish society exhibited at that time and that can explain the development of this phenomenon.

#### 3. Results

In the first place, it must be specified that the press available on the HNE did not provide data related to *tuteo* until the end of the 18th century. The first occurrence that arises dates from 1790, in *El Correo de Madrid*, in the section of letters to the editor, and it criticises the expansion of *tuteo* in school, which the newspaper relates to the confusion and disorder that reigned in the institutions. The following example jumps to 1813, in *El Procurador General de la Nación y del Rey* (belonging to the most reactionary sector and financed by the clergy and nobility), whose political bias promoted the idea of monarchical absolutism. In this occurrence, it is possible to observe the attitude towards *tuteo* in a political comedy sketch (1).

(1) Sí, amigo, por interés no precisamente por dinero, como Vd. Tal vez creerá. Unos se desgañitan gritando justicia, justicia, sin perdonar piante ni mamante, esperando ponerse en zancos; otros vociferan patriotismo hasta ponerse roncos, para darse a conocer por la pinta y ponerse en fila de pretendientes; otros respiran o afectan igualdad, aunque sean marqueses y condes, dexándose casi tutear (El Procurador General de la Nación y del Rey, 20th May 1813, 3)

'Yes, friend, for interest and not precisely for money, as you [polite] may think. Some yell *justice*, *justice*, without forgiving anybody; others shout *patriotism* until they are voiceless, just to show off; others breathe or perform *egalitarianism* though they are marquises or counts, allowing the rest to treat them with  $t\hat{u}$ '.

From then on, the results of *tuteo* rise exponentially. In another absolutist and ultra-Catholic newspaper, *El Restaurador*, it is said (2):

(2) ¿Pues qué diremos de esa costumbre introducida por el sistema de igualdad en que un padre con más años que Matusalén se empeña en que le han de tutear los niños, llamándole el apellido a secas, ni más ni menos que si fuera otro tal? (El Restaurador, 31st October 1823, 7)

'What could we say about the fashion introduced by the system of egalitarianism in which a father older than Methuselah strives to be treated with  $t\hat{u}$  by his offspring, as if he were at the same level?'

The majority of the results are in feuilletons. Below, I present an excerpt from 1840, from *El Corresponsal*, also conservative, albeit moderate (3):

(3) –Mucho has tardado en bajar, le dijo con aire de dulce reconvención, y empleando el tuteo, que usaba por lo común con extremada parsimonia, y solo en los instantes de cariñoso buen humor continuó. Acaba de ocurrírseme un gran pensamiento. ¿Sabes en quién he pensado para reemplazar a nuestro amigo? ¿A que no lo aciertas? (*El Corresponsal*, 5th September 1840, 2)

'You have taken your time to come down, he said sweetly and employing *tuteo*, which he used with extreme parsimony, and only in the good and affectionate mood he continued: I have just come up with a thought, do you know who I thought of to replace our friend? Guess who'.

But in newspaper feuilletons considered progressive, such as in *El Constitucional*, opinions about *tuteo* are also shown. Let us look at an excerpt from 1841 (4):

(4) ¿No es un dolor el haber de renunciar a esta cariñosa familiaridad, a este delicioso tuteo que permiten los bailes de carnaval? Ahora te hablo como se hablan los amigos íntimos, los hermanos, los esposos, los amantes. Pues y si cometo la indiscreción de quitarme la careta, te faltará tiempo para levantarte y apenas podrás articular un tibio y desapacible: a los pies de usted. (El Constitucional, 26th January 1841, 1)

'Isn't it painful to forsake this affectionate familiarity, this delicious *tuteo* allowed by Carnival balls? Now I am speaking to you as close friends, siblings, spouses, lovers speak one another. And if I am so indiscreet to take off my mask, you will be able to pronounce the uneasy at your [polite] feet'.

In *El Eco del Comercio*, in 1845, liberal and progressive, feuilletons often express ideas about *tuteo* too (5 - 6):

(5) Por consiguiente, no tengo *don* y no lo admito: porque además de las razones dichas, harto poderosas, hay otra especialísima mía, cual es la de que yo al hablar a todo el mundo le apeo el tratamiento, quiero decir que le tuteo. En esto soy cristiano rancio, verdadero cristiano; a nadie dijo Cristo: oiga, usted, señor don Fulano. (*El Eco del Comercio*, 17th October 1845, 2)

'As a consequence, I don't have any treatment and I don't admit it, because besides the mentioned and powerful reasons, I have another one very personal. When I talk, I don't resort to any treatment, that means, I employ *tuteo* to everybody. I am an old Christian to this respect, because Christ never said: listen, mister X [polite]'.

(6) Remy, yo acostumbro a tutear a las personas a quienes aprecio. (*El Eco del Comercio*, 17th October 1845, page 2)

'Remy, I usually employ tuteo to the people I appreciate'.

In El Clamor Público, in a token from 1846, the following is specified in its feuilleton (7):

(7) En la educación de Luciano, el dejar de repente de tutear a su mujer indicaba suficientemente toda la autoridad de que quería revestirse. (*El Clamor Público*, 29th January 1845, page 2)

'In Luciano's education, to suddenly stop employing *tuteo* to his wife meant he became the authority'.

And in another occurrence of 1847 (8), it is suggested:

(8) – Aguardan las órdenes, contestó Dionisio, que se pasó a tutear a Morillon, siguiendo las costumbres republicanas. (*El Clamor Público*, 11th July 1847, page 1)

'They are waiting for orders, answered Dionisio, who started using *tuteo* to Morillon, following Republican traditions'.

Unlike the positive or, at least, non-negative attitude in the progressive press, the conservative media maintain opposite ideas even in the mid-nineteenth century, as in this 1850 excerpt from *El Heraldo* (9):

(9) –Abomino el tutear, respondió Tiburcio. El tú socava la dignidad en el trato, es costumbre lugareña, no somos parientes para usar de esa exagerada franqueza. Así, respóndame con confianza, que el usted no disminuye esta ni el aprecio. (El Heraldo, 17th April 1850, page 1)

'I despise *tuteo*, answered Tiburcio. *Tuteo* undermines the dignity of treatment, it is a local costume, we are not relatives to use that exaggerated sincerity. So, answer me with confidence, *usted* does not worsen trust and affection'.

In the section of varieties, from the conservative newspaper *La Esperanza*, in 1851, the following is specified (10):

(10) Voy a combatir hasta donde pueda esa costumbre de buen tono, exclusiva casi de la aristocracia, de tutear los hijos a sus padres. (*La Esperanza*, 9th December 1851, page 4)

'I will fight my best this trend, nearly exclusive of nobility, in which children use *tuteo* towards their parents'.

In a feuilleton from 1852, from *El Clamor Público*, it is said (11):

(11) Estrepitosas carcajadas acogían las palabras de esta mujer: aun cuando no le faltaba talento, ciertas expresiones vulgares y el tuteo que empleaba, probaban que no pertenecía a la más escogida sociedad. Sin embargo, parecía perfectamente instruida en las clases más elevadas y exclusivas. (El Clamor Público, 8th February 1852, page 1)

'They burst out laughing because of the words of this woman, though she did not lack talent. Certain vulgar expressions and the *tuteo* she employed demonstrated that she did not belong to the most selected society. However, she seemed perfectly educated in the upper and exclusive class'.

Still in the same decade, in 1854, the *Semanario Pintoresco Español*, of progressive nature, argues in its section of social virtues (12):

(12) Sabrá que llevar del brazo, dar la mano y tutear, son pruebas indispensables de la más pura amistad. (*Semanario Pintoresco Español*, 26th February 1854, page 8)

'You surely know that taking the arm, shaking hands, and using *tuteo* are indispensable proofs of the purest friendship'.

In *Revista de España*, in 1868, it is possible to observe the following excerpt in a section called draft of a novel (13):

(13) Tutear al Marqués de Tilli era para la pollería imberbe adquirir diploma de hombre y merecer una galantería de sus labios motivo de orgullo aun para las que figuraban en el ejército de reserva que en la sociedad forman las mamás. (*Revista de España*, May 1868, page 418)

'To employ *tuteo* to the Marquis of Tilli was for the beardless young aristocracy to acquire the status of a man and to deserve a compliment from him, a fact that made their moms be proud of them'.

However, the conservative press, as in the following excerpt of a tale from *La Guirnalda*, 1872, insists on the negative attitude (14).

- (14) –En cuanto a ese tuteo al que nos ha habituado la igualdad que reinaba en cátedra nada se opone, mi querido Raoul, a que la sustituyamos con un usted ceremonioso. No te ocultaré que este cambio me será fácil.
- -Tiene usted razón, querido Eduardo –respondió el joven conde de Chavigny. –Este tuteo nos daba efectivamente aire de dos liceístas, en tanto que el usted nos lo dará de hombres formales. (*La Guirnalda*, 16th October 1872, page 4)

'As for this *tuteo* egalitarianism has made us be accustomed to, there is nothing that stops us, dear Raoul, to replace it by distant *usted*. I won't hide that this change is easier to me.

You [polite] are right, dear Eduardo –answered the young count of Chavigny- This *tuteo* made us seem two immature men, whereas the use of *usted* makes us be two formal men'.

Already in 1886, in *La Hormiga de Oro*, extremely conservative, in the question / answer section, the following can be read (15):

(15) Pregunta 130: -¿Cómo se explica la costumbre cada vez más extendida, sobre todo en las grandes poblaciones, de tutear los hijos a los padres?

Respuesta: -El tuteo de los hijos a los padres tiene un origen vergonzoso. No se puede pronunciar sin rubor el nombre de sus autores: los *sansculottes* del 92. Esta sola razón ¿no es ya suficiente para desterrar tan deplorable costumbre del hogar de toda familia honrada que sabe respetarse a sí propia? Además, el tuteo es absurdo en sí mismo, por cuanto tiende a establecer una igualdad contra la naturaleza. Los padres son, por derecho natural y divino, los superiores de sus hijos. Por consiguiente, querer establecer entre ellos y sus hijos la igualdad es ir contra el orden natural. (*La Hormiga de Oro*, 15th December 1886, page 10)

'Question 130: -What are the reasons of the more and more diffused trend, mainly in urban areas, of using *tuteo* from children to parents?

Answer: *Tuteo* from children towards their parents has a shameful origin. It is impossible to pronounce without blushing the name of its authors: the *sansculottes* from 92. This single reason, isn't it enough as to oust so embarrassing fashion from every honest family which can respect itself? Furthermore, *tuteo* is absurd itself, since it tends to establish a type of egalitarianism against nature. Parents are, by natural and divine right, superior to their children. As a result, willing to establish among them and their children egalitarianism is going against the natural order'.

These opinions in line with the corresponding ideology continued until the end of the century, since in an excerpt from 1895, in a chronicle of the feminist newspaper *El Album Ibero-Americano*, it is said (16):

(16) Tiene la amistad como el amor la privilegiada condición de igualar a los seres a quienes aprieta con sus lazos dulces y caros; bórranse las distancias, abate a los grandes y eleva a los pequeños, junta en haz estrechísimo de cariño, las riquezas con las miserias, la inteligencia audaz y el entendimiento oscuro, cosas que a maravilla resume el trato familiar y llano sin ceremonias de vanos cumplidos que entre los amigos se observa, que en el tuteo afectuoso encuentra síntesis admirable brotado espontáneamente, pues es regla de la amistad dar sin exigir, pero con la condición de que todos los

unidos por sus nudos apretados seguirán la misma máxima. (*El Album Ibero-Americano*, 22nd October 1895, page 4)

'Friendship, like love, can make beings it wraps equal among each other. Distances are erased, the big are defeated and the small are elevated. It puts together with affection wealth and misery, witty intelligence and dark understanding; these things are observed in plain and familiar treatment, without ceremony of vain compliments between friends. Affectionate *tuteo* finds admirable synthesis spontaneously emerged, as it is a rule of friendship to give without demanding, but under the condition that all the united by its knots will follow the same maxim'.

Therefore, as a general rule, although attitudes towards *tuteo* have mainly arisen in feuilletons or tales, the positive and negative comments can be divided almost systematically depending on the ideology of the media. Even so, it is possible to observe not only the importance of the political bias of the press, but the excerpts I have shown allow for clarifying the origin of *tuteo* and its extension throughout the nineteenth-century society. Below, I will analyse the results and compare them to what happened in other countries or other chronological stages of the language.

# 4. Analysis and discussion

The occurrences shown in the previous section suggest several realities: firstly, Spain tended to solidarity from the late 18th century onwards; secondly, the fashion for solidarity came from upper classes but was contested by the conservative; and thirdly, the origin of this trend was a French influence.

#### 4.1. Pragmatics of the change

The data evidence that, unlike what had been argued so far, the increase of *tuteo* timidly originates in the late 18th century and grows exponentially as the 19th century advances. At least, this is the conclusion that can be reached based on the results, since there is no data that account for this pragmatic change in virtually the entire 1700's. In the different examples, it is possible to notice that *tuteo* is associated with a certain idea of egalitarianism, of friendship, proximity and intimacy (17 - 21).

(17) El secreto que te voy a confiar te lo hubiera revelado el mismo Poyer, dijo Deville estableciendo por medio del tuteo la intimidad que debía existir entre él y Valvins (*El Clamor Público*, 6th February 1846, page 1)

'The secret I am telling you could have been revealed by Poyer, said Deville, establishing by means of *tuteo* the intimacy that should exist between him and Valvins'.

(18) No, Luis, te perdono, pues que tú no sabías que estuviera yo allí, dijo Rosa, que hacía ya tiempo tenía la costumbre de tutear al gran Luis, su amigo de infancia [...] y sabía bien que una sola palabra de su boca acompañada de este delicioso tú cambiaba en un gozo expansivo todos los disgustos de su amante (El Espectador, 30th April 1846, page 2)

'No, Luis, I forgive you, for you didn't know I was here, said Rosa, who had had for long the costume to use *tuteo* with Luis, her childhood friend [...] and she perfectly knew that a single word out of her mouth accompanied by this delicious *tú* changed happily all her lover's annoyance'.

(19) Con los que son iguales a mí, aunque sea la primera vez que nos vemos, los tuteo y ellos a mí (*La Nación*, 25th March 1850, page 2)

'To those who are as equal as me, though it may be the first time we meet, I use *tuteo* and they to me'.

(20) ¡Es cosa singular! Vuestro padre me tutea, yo tuteo a vuestro padre y nosotros no nos tuteamos todavía; vaya, es preciso regularizar esta situación (*La Corona*, 24th February 1860, page 8)

'It is curious. Your father uses *tuteo* with me, I use *tuteo* with your father and we don't treat each other with  $tt\acute{u}$  yet; it is high time we regularised this situation'.

(21) ¿Y por qué no? O la quiero a vd. mucho y por eso la tuteo. Yo no hablo de vd. a mi perro, sino cuando es malo (*Museo de las Familias*, 1862, page 127)

'And why not? I love you very much and that's why I use *tuteo* to you. I don't treat my dog with *usted*, only when he behaves badly'.

Not only is this supported by my data, but different authors have repeatedly drawn attention to this fact. Fernández Martín (2012) provides empirical data that demonstrate the increase of plural *tuteo* by means of *vosotros* during the 19<sup>th</sup> century. According to this author, along the 1800's the Spanish society accepted gradually the usage of *vosotros* in situations that could only be materialised through *ustedes* prior to that time. Likewise, García Godoy (2010, 2012) attests the spread of *mamá* ('mom') and *papá* ('dad') at the expense of *madre* ('mother') and *padre* ('father') simultaneously to the extension of *vosotros* and *tú*. Based on her research, the establishment of these forms entailed the employment of *tuteo* towards parents, contesting the hierarchy that family relations represented. From that moment on, people who held an inferior position with respect to others in the family hierarchy (i.e.: children-parents, nephews-uncles, grandchildren-grandparents...) left aside pronouns and forms associated with formality and distance: in other words, *usted(es)* stopped being valid as pronouns of address within the family.

Ever since, *tuteo* both in singular and plural has gradually extended over situations that encompassed *usted(es)*. Therefore, the generalisation of *tuteo* began in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century and early 19<sup>th</sup> century, and increased exponentially until the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, a moment in which *tuteo* was not already subject to ideologies. In fact, for Molina Martos (2020), *tuteo* was already frequent in the Spanish Civil War on both sides. As a result, the statements by De Jonge and Nieuwenhuijsen (2012) about the spread of *tuteo* after de collapse of the dictatorship is really another wave within the frame of the generalisation of *tuteo* that was born in the late 1700's.

The results I have supplied as well as the findings by Molina Martos (2020), Fernández Martin (2012) and García Godoy (2010, 2012) suggest that the late-18<sup>th</sup>-century Spanish society chose solidarity as the non-marked strategy of politeness, contravening the tradition of power, distance and deference that had characterised Spain. As a matter of fact, if a brief history of the Spanish pragmatic development is considered, it is possible to observe a continuous effort to re-establish power and distance forms in order to substitute those which stopped connoting these concepts.

Medieval Spanish possessed a French-style system, in which vós worked as current French vous. However, the generalisation of vós as a polite pronoun triggered the emergence of new alternatives. Vós

was used in the whole social spectrum and started to being perceived as T rather than V. The new forms that arose were made up by abstract nouns preceded by possessive (*vuestra merced* 'your mercy', *vuestra excelencia* 'your excellence', *vuestra señoría* 'your lordship', etc.). The decline of *vós* as V as well as the uncertainty about the actual usage of all the alternatives that were born reached such a stage that even the king, Phillip the Second, passed a decree that perfectly pinpointed what form had to be employed by whom and to whom (Lapesa 2000). In any case, all of them connoted power and distance relationships, since informal pronouns like *tú* or *vosotros* had very restrained uses.

According to Calderón Campos (2019) and Fernández Martín (2012), T forms could only be used by the upper classes when they addressed lower ones and, within the latter, from parents to children or from a relative that was hierarchically superior towards one who was in an inferior position. Therefore, T forms were quite marked and V ones could be resorted to even among friends, as well as acquaintances, unknown people, relatives who were in a higher rank in the family hierarchy and it was not either frequent to use V pronouns between relatives that shared the same position. Hence, Spain preferred distance and power rather than solidarity.

This preference began to shift in the late 1700's, as I have already demonstrated, by fostering the usage of solidarity pronouns in more and more contexts, until the present being, in which V forms are marked. Nonetheless, the choice for solidarity was not unanimous. The Spanish press of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries shows mixed opinions regarding the increase of *tuteo*. According to the data, newspapers called progressive and / or republican maintain positive attitude regarding *tuteo*, associating it with greater intimacy, solidarity and friendship. On the opposite pole are the newspapers classified as conservative and / or monarchists, who choose to discredit *tuteo* by linking it with foreign, republican or poorly educated practices.

This dual view of a pragmatic change is not an isolated issue. As a matter of fact, the concept of courtesy changes from society to society. In other words, politeness is nothing more than what a given society understands as such (Watts 2003). For this author, without going any further, the concept of courtesy in present-day England is heir to what the highest stratum of the eighteenth-century society, the one that held the economic, social and political power, imposed as a model. Brown and Gilman (1960) agree on that when comparing the forms of address in the French Revolution to those in the Old Regime. For them, the usage of the courteous *vous* decreased during the French Revolution as one more response against the hierarchy of the previous feudal regime. Kocher (1968) alleges that communist Yugoslavia promoted the use of *comrade* and sanctioned courteous forms as an ideological strategy more in line with Marxist theory. Likewise, the rise of informal forms in Western Europe after World War II is related to the willingness to fulfil the concept of democracy (Moreno Fernández 1986).

The tendency towards solidarity that Spain exhibits in the late 1700's and the 1800's resembles the pattern attested elsewhere in Europe. All western countries underwent the same processes during the same period of time. Solidarity generalised as the politeness strategy within the family and it extended over friendship and marital relationships. In all these countries, pragmatic solidarity started to connote liberalism and democracy, but the ulterior stages of all of them have been uneven. Whereas Germany or

France have maintained deference in large part of contexts (Coffen 2002), Spain has diffused solidarity in almost any situation. Portugal, however, adopted solidarity later than Spain and it is not until the last third of the 20<sup>th</sup> century when it also reaches the family environment (Lara Bermejo and Guilherme 2021).

#### 4.2. Sociolinguistics of the change

The attitudes expressed in the press have also revealed the sociolinguistic profile that started to resort to solidarity. The occurrences I have provided indicate that the upper classes were the promoters of this fashion. For instance, (13) suggests that the idea of egalitarianism becomes fashionable precisely in the upper classes. Tokens (22-24) remark this possibility too.

(22) Dícese que la Reina Isabel II recibirá una educación más sencilla y que se suprimirán ciertas fórmulas y etiquetas que hasta ahora se han observado en palacio, tales como las de tutear las personas reales a todo el mundo, el hincar la rodilla para hablarles, de besarles la mano, etc. (*Diario Constitucional de Palma*, 9th November 1840, page 2)

'It is said that Queen Elisabeth the Second will receive more plain education and certain forms and labels valid in daily life in palace will be supressed. These are using *tuteo* to everybody on the part of royal people, getting on one's knees to speak to them, kissing their hands, etc.'.

(23) Los diputados de sus concejos eran dos prelados, dos señores y dos del estado llano, que disfrutaban desde tiempo inmemorial de tutear al emperador (*El Español*, 23rd July 1845, page 4)

'The deputies were two priests, two lords and two ordinary men who had enjoyed for quite long using *tuteo* towards the emperor'.

(24) Voy a combatir hasta donde pueda esa costumbre de buen tono, exclusiva casi de la aristocracia, de tutear los hijos a sus padres (*La Esperanza*, 9th December 1851, page 4)

'I will fight my best this trend, nearly exclusive of nobility, in which children use *tuteo* towards their parents'.

These excerpts are very relevant, since they underpin the findings of Molina Martos (2020), when she affirms that *tuteo* in the family comes from the upper classes. Moreover, García Godoy (2010, 2012) highlights that the so-called *pollería* (the young upper class from Madrid) fostered the usage of *mamá* and *papá* instead of *madre* and *padre*. Likewise, Fernández Martín (2012) and Lara Bermejo (2022) point out that *vosotros* at the expense of *ustedes* is firstly documented in urban upper classes of central and northern Spain.

The introduction of *tuteo* on the part of the upper classes was not only crucial for its later extension, but the establishment of *tuteo* within the family atmosphere was the real pragmatic revolution of that time and it was prompted by aristocracy. Observe instance (25).

(25) La naturaleza nos lleva a tutear a los seres que nos rodean y que viven en nuestra intimidad, nuestros hermanos, nuestras hermanas, nuestros amigos del colegio [...]. Cesa el tutear cuando el afecto se mezcla con el respeto [...]. ¿Es conveniente acostumbrarlos a tutear a sus padres o debe impedírseles el tomar semejante costumbre? La etiqueta del antiguo régimen se hubiera sublevado al solo anuncio de esta atrevida cuestión [...]. Hoy la educación ha cambiado tanto al menos como la constitución de

la familia. Es inmenso el número de hijos a quienes su padre y su madre les permiten tutearlos. (*El Museo de las Familias*, 1861, page 80)

'Nature leads us to use *tuteo* to the beings around us and who live in our intimacy, our brothers, our sisters, our school friends [...]. *Tuteo* ceases when affection mixes with respect [...]. Is it convenient to get them used to using *tuteo* towards their parents or must it be disallowed? The label of the Old Regime would have rebelled against the mere announcement of this daring issue [...]. Nowadays, education has changed as much as has the constitution of family. The number of children whose parents allow them to use *tuteo* to them is overwhelming'.

This excerpt belongs to *El Museo de las Familias*, in 1861, and explicitly compares the new uses to those of the Old Regime, and it affirms that the previous political system would not have allowed *tuteo* in family relations. However, even though all these innovations emerge in the upper class, they are widespread by the middle class in the late 19th century and the early 20th century (Lapesa 1996, Molina Martos 2020). The importance of middle classes that were born during the increasing industrialisation and urbanisation prompted the extension of solidarity throughout the entire social spectrum. Indeed, as I have already stated, Molina Martos (2020) defends that *tuteo* is not an ideological matter anymore in the Spanish Civil War. This was not the case in the 18th and 19th centuries. Based on my results, the flattering or sceptical view depended on the media. On the whole, newspapers classified as progressive and / or republican show positive attitudes towards the use of *tuteo* or, at least, do not reject it. On the contrary, newspapers called conservatives and / or monarchists vehemently warn about the social danger that the rise of *tuteo* entailed.

## 4.3. Geographical origin

Once I have shown the pragmatic and sociolinguistic features that conditioned the increase of solidarity in Spain from the late 18<sup>th</sup> century onwards, the results I have obtained can also account for the geographical origin of this fashion.

This innovative usage seems to stem from France. Tokens (26-29) suggest the likely French influence in this pragmatic change and in (15), the *sansculottes* are accused of the tendency towards solidarity. Many of the feuilletons where *tuteo* arises are set in France and have French characters as protagonists. In addition, (26) resorts to the republican adjective to also blame republicanism for the increase of *tuteo*.

(26) Esteban iba en fin a retirarse, cuando una mujer de edad y vestida pobremente, que estaba desde el alba sentada junto al parapeto y que Esteban creyó ser una pordiosera, lo detuvo. Caballero, le dijo, en un tono que contrastaba extrañamente con su traje, y sin emplear el tuteo republicano, sin duda esperáis como yo, tened paciencia: tal vez si hay en los calabozos alguna persona que os interese, podré yo facilitaros los medios de darle noticias vuestras (El Corresponsal, 26th December 1843, page 2)

'Esteban was about to leave when a poorly dressed elderly woman, who had been since dawn sitting next to the parapet and about whom Esteban thought she was a beggar, stopped him. Gentleman, she said in a way that contradicted her dress and without employing the republican *tuteo*, you are sure to be

waiting like I am, be patient, perhaps if there is someone in prison you may be interested in, I will be able to supply you with the means to give him news of yours'.

(27) ¡Cómo, sobrina!, exclamó el general. ¿También quieres tú entrar en esa moda que nos ha venido de Francia, como todas las que corrompen las costumbres? // Conque el tuteo entre padres e hijos corrompe las costumbres? // Sí, sobrina, como todo lo que contribuye a disminuir el respeto, sea lo que fuere. Por esto me gustaba la antigua costumbre de los grandes de España, que exigían el tratamiento de excelencia a sus hijos (*La Esperanza*, 18th May 1861, page 1)

'Pardon, niece!, said the general. Do you also want to adopt that fashion that has come from France, as all that make traditions corrupted? // So *tuteo* from children to parents makes traditions corrupted? // Yes, niece, as everything that helps minimise respect, whatever it may be. This is why I liked the old tradition of the Spanish nobility, who demanded their children the treatment of excellence'.

(28) Te tuteo porque aquí, en Madrid, hay la costumbre de tutear a los monos sabios, sin que estos se ofendan nunca (*La Lidia*, 17th October 1887, page 1)

'I use *tuteo* with you because here, in Madrid, it is usual to employ *tuteo* to wise monkeys, without them getting offended'.

(29) Asombrado y confundido pasó todo un mes conmigo un amigo y paisano que vino a ver París y a aturdirse por su dinero, viéndome tutear a periodistas, actrices y medias mundanas. Y es que el hombre ignoraba usos y costumbres parisienses, que solo son permitidos al que ha tenido no sé si la fortuna o la desgracia de vivir durante quince años día y noche con eso que se llama el todo París y que yo voy a cambiar con gusto por los tranquilos y pacíficos habitantes del País Vasco, dentro de pocos días (El Liberal, 20th September 1896, page 1)

'Very stunned and confused a wealthy friend of mine spent a month with me here in Paris. He saw me use *tuteo* to journalists, actresses and high society. But this friend did not know the uses and costumes from Paris, which are only allowed for better and for worse to those who have lived here for fifteen years and have treated the so-called all Paris. But I will move willingly to the Basque Country in a few days'.

This republicanism is twofold, in the sense that it refers to the political desire within Spain to break the monarchical regime and, at the same time, it can refer to the political regime the French Revolution gave birth. Indeed, token (27) explicitly says that *tuteo* comes from France.

The possible French influence regarding the pronouns of address within the Iberian Peninsula is supported by the happenings of other stages of the Spanish address system. If we go back to the establishment of the compound pronouns *nosotros* ('we') and *vosotros* ('you') in Spanish around the fourteenth century, Fernández-Ordóñez (2011) and Gomila Albal (2016) affirm that their introduction is a direct influence of Catalan. While the first author comes to this conclusion through the geolinguistics found at the Ibero-Romance level, the second confirms this thesis by comparing medieval data of all the peninsular Romance languages. However, Lara Bermejo (2019) goes more in depth into the reconstruction of compound forms by extracting the geographical distribution of the 1pl and 2pl pronouns throughout the Romania. Based on the data that he presents, the compound forms of 1pl and 2pl are in a more advanced level of grammaticalization in the south of France, in contact with Catalan and with the

northern Italian varieties. The data he provides show forms with loss of phonic weight that are not attested elsewhere in the Iberian Peninsula. And, although the level of grammaticalization is not *per se* a reason that leads to the conclusion that they are prior to others not grammaticalized (perfect tenses present a higher level of grammaticalization in Peninsular Spanish than in French or Italian, although they arise later in Spanish, Rodríguez Molina 2016), Koschwitz (1894), Ronjat (1937), Jensen (1994) and Vanelli (1987) state that these compound forms were already settled in that area almost two centuries before they were attested in Spanish.

The French influence is again witnessed in the use of *mamá* and *papá* at the expense of *madre* and *padre*, as García Godoy (2010, 2012) underlies, and *vosotros* in plural is triggered by the exchange between France and northern Spain (Lara Bermejo 2020). The spatial diffusion of all these phenomena (specifically: the generalisation of *vosotros*, the spread of *mamá* and *papá*, and *tuteo* in singular) present an identical pattern. All of them arise in upper classes, urban environments and the central and northern regions within Spain. Once they are established in these areas, these phenomena further extend throughout the country. Consequently, the pragmatic solidarity embodied in *tuteo*, *vosotros* as well as *mamá* and *papá* arrive several decades later in southern Spain, as has been put forth by García Godoy (2008) and Calderón Campos (2010). The reason for this geographical model can be found in O'Flanagan (2008).

According to this author, Spain has always been characterised by its enormous differences within its territory. The cohesion among regions has not been the norm and this has reflected in trade. Whereas the south has had strong contacts with America, the northern ports have always exchanged commodities with their European counterparts. For O'Flanagan (2008), these connections have also affected migration and the demographic behaviour of each area, in such a way that southern Spain has had more ties with American than with other Spanish regions. The same applies to central and northern Spain, which have always maintained unity, but they have disregarded their relations with the southern part. The current system of address underpins these divergences, for great part of southern Spain possesses a paradigm that resembles that of America, while the rest of the country exhibits a different one.

In the 18th and 19th centuries, the fashion for solidarity that emerges in the northern half of Spain is coherent with the trends elsewhere in Europe: the area with which it had continuously kept a close relationship. Moreover, the time lapse I have studied in this article coincides precisely with the moment in which France represented prestige. As a consequence, the rest of languages were more inclined to adopt uses that came from this country. Joseph (1987) determines that French was the standard and prestigious language among the upper classes throughout Central Europe and Russia. Even Royal families spoke among each other in French rather than in their national languages. In fact, the current opposition in Russian between *ty-wy* is influence from French *tu-vous*. As the new reigning Royal house in Spain from 1700 onwards was French and not Austrian, and because northern Spain had more commercial and contact ties with France than with elsewhere in the country, the urban upper classes started to adopt French usages in order to succeed in acquiring prestige. Once these innovations established themselves, they further extended nationwide, being the southern regions the last ones to incorporate them.

The birth of Pragmatic Solidarity in Spain: Contesting Centuries of Power and Distance

# 5. Conclusions

The attitudes of the 18<sup>th</sup>- and 19<sup>th</sup>-century Spanish press suggest that Spain underwent deep pragmatic changes, by tending for the first time in its history towards solidarity. This fashion was promoted by urban upper classes from the northern half of the country, mainly by the young aristocrats, who not only employed more and more informal forms but they started to use T pronouns within their family relations. This turning point together with the new beliefs that came from France after the French Revolution produced the rise of terms and pronouns that were associated with friendship, closeness, intimacy, commencing a development that arrives until the present being, in which power and distance pronouns are marked, unlike the reality of the early 1700's.

However, this fashion was not unanimous in the two centuries I have analysed, since the opposing ideologies either favoured or disfavoured this trend. But the unstoppable increase towards solidarity made it possible for the whole Spanish society to gradually accept solidarity as the least marked strategy of politeness. The literature determines the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century as the moment in which solidarity was not subject to any political ideology, but the data I have presented reveal that *tuteo* dates back in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century and increases exponentially in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, as happened elsewhere in Europe.

ولادة التضامن العملى(البراغماتي) في إسبانيا: التنافس على قرون من القوة والمسافة

فيكتور لارا بيرميجو قسم اللغة الإنجليزية، جامعة قادش، إسبانيا

يعد استخدام الضمائر غير الرسمية في أي سياق تقريبًا، في إسبانيا الحالية، أسلوباً مرتبطاً بتأسيس الديمقراطية. ومع ذلك، تشير أحدث الأبحاث إلى أن هذا الاتجاه نحو التضامن بدأ منذ أكثر من مانتي عام. نعتزم في هذا المقال تقديم وصف للأراء والمواقف الموجودة في الصحافة الإسبانية في القرنين الثامن عشر والتاسع عشر، من أجل اكتشاف الأصول الاجتماعية والجغرافية لهذه الحقيقة، وكذلك ردود فعل وسائل الإعلام المختلفة، وفقًا لأيديولوجيتهم. تظهر البيانات أن موضة التضامن تأتى من فرنسا وتنتشر من قبل الطبقة العليا في المراكز الحضرية، على الرغم من أن الطيف المحافظ للمجتمع ينازعه بشدة.

الكلمات المفتاحية: أشكال التعامل؛ التضامن؛ المخاطبة العامة؛ الإسبانية؛ مواقف الصحافة.

# References

- Abadía de Quant, Inés. 1992. La Relación Pronominal-Verbal de Segunda Persona Singular en el Español de Corrientes durante el Siglo XIX, su Comparación con la Situación en Buenos Aires. *Revista Argentina de Lingüística* 8: 31-46.
- Alonso, Dámaso. 1962. "La muerte del usted". In *Del siglo de oro a este siglo de siglas*, ed. Dámaso Alonso, 264-267. Madrid: Gredos.
- Brown, Roger, and Albert Gilman. 1960. The Pronouns of Power and Solidarity. In *Style in language*, ed. Thomas Sebeok, 253-276. Cambridge: MIT.
- Calderón Campos, Miguel. 2010. "Los Elementos Nominales en el Sistema de Tratamiento del Español de Andalucía durante la Restauración (1875-1931)". In *Formas y fórmulas de tratamiento en el mundo hispánico*, ed. Martin Hummel, Bettina Kluge and María Eugenia Vázquez Laslop, 551-570. Mexico City: El Colegio de México / Karl-Franzens-Universität Graz.
- Calderón Campos, Miguel. 2019. Pérdida del Pronombre Vosotros y su Paradigma. In *Estudios de morfosintaxis histórica hispanoamericana*, ed. Esther Hernández, Eva Bravo García, Félix Fernández de Castro and Juan Pedro Sánchez Méndez, 125-162. Valencia: Tirant.
- Coffen, Béatrice. 2002. Histoire Culturelle des Pronoms d'Adresse: Vers une Typologie des Systèmes Allocutoires dans les Langues Romanes. Paris: H. Champion.
- Company Company, Concepción. 2012. "El español del siglo XVIII: un parteaguas lingüístico entre España y México". In El *español del siglo* XVIII. Cambios diacrónicos en el primer español moderno, ed. María Teresa García Godoy, 255-291. Bern: Peter Lang.
- De Jonge, Bob, and Dorien Nieuwenhuijsen. 2012. Forms of Address. In *The handbook of Hispanic linguistics*, ed. Juan Ignacio Hualde, Antxon Olarrea and Erin O'Rourke, 247-262. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Faraco, Carlos. 1996. O Tratamento Você em Português: Uma Abordagem Histórica. *Fragmenta* 13: 51 82
- Fernández Martín, Elisabeth. 2012. *La Oposición Vosotros / Ustedes en la Historia del Español Peninsular* (1700 1931). Granada: Universidad de Granada.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. 2011. La Lengua de Castilla y la Formación del Español. Madrid: Espasa.
- Fontanella de Weinberg, Beatriz. 1999. Sistemas Pronominales de Tratamiento Usados en El Mundo Hispánico. In *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, ed. Ignacio Bosque and Violeta Demonte, 1399-1425. Madrid: Espasa.
- García Godoy, María Teresa. 2008. La Reconstrucción del Sistema de Tratamientos en el Español de Andalucía (siglo XIX)". In Actas del VI Congreso Nacional de la Asociación de Jóvenes Investigadores de la Historiografía e Historia de la Lengua Española, ed. Esteban Montoro del Arco, 31-65. Granada: Universidad de Granada.
- García Godoy, María Teresa. 2010. El Tratamiento a los Progenitores en el Español Peninsular (siglo XIX). Contraste dos variedades geográficas". In *Formas y fórmulas de tratamiento en el mundo hispánico*, ed. Martin Hummel, Bettina Kluge and María Eugenia Vázquez Laslop, 595-617. Mexico

- City: El Colegio de México / Universität Karl-Franzens Graz.
- García Godoy, María Teresa. 2012. El Español del Siglo XVIII. Cambios Diacrónicos en el Primer Español Moderno. Bern: Peter Lang.
- Gomila Albal, Marina. 2016. Sobre el Origen y la Difusión Geográfica de las Formas Nosotros y Vosotros en Castellano. *Iberoromania* 83: 103 125.
- Hemeroteca Nacional Española. http://hemerotecadigital.bne.es/index.vm.
- Hickey, Raymond. 2003. The German Address System: Binary and Scalar At Once. In *Diachronic perspectives on address term systems: Pragmatics and beyond*, ed. Irma Taavitsainen and Andreas Jucker, 401-425. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Hummel, Martin, Bettina Kluge, and María Eugenia Vázquez Laslop. 2010. Formas y Fórmulas de Tratamiento en el Mundo Hispánico. Mexico City: El Colegio de México / Karl-Franzens-Universität Graz.
- Jensen, Frede. 1994. The syntax of Medieval Occitan. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer.
- Joseph, John Earl. 1987. Eloquence and Power: The Rise of Language Standards and Standard Languages. London: Burns and Oates.
- Kocher, Margaret. 1968. Second Person Pronouns in Serbo-Croatian. Language 43 (3): 725-741.
- Koschwitz, Eduard. 1894. Grammaire Historique de la Langue des Felibres. Geneva: Slaktine.
- Lapesa, Rafael. 1996. El Español Moderno y Contemporáneo. Estudios lingüísticos. Barcelona: Mondadori.
- Lapesa, Rafael. 2000. Estudios de Morfosintaxis Histórica. Madrid: Gredos.
- Lara Bermejo, Víctor. 2019. The Geolinguistics of the Ibero-Romance Comitative. *Dialectologia et Geolinguistica* 27: 51-71.
- Lara Bermejo, Víctor. 2020. Actitudes Hacia el Tuteo en la España Borbónica. In *Creencias y actitudes ante la lengua en la España y América de los siglos XVIII y XIX*, ed. Manuel Rivas and Victoriano Gaviño, 175-192. Madrid/Frankfurt: Iberoamericana/Vervuert.
- Lara Bermejo, Víctor. 2022. El Pronombre Vosotros Bajo el Reinado de los Borbones. *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica* 70 (1): 3-26.
- Lara Bermejo, Víctor, and Ana Guilherme. 2021. The Diachrony of Pronouns of Address in 20th-Century European Portuguese. *Studies in Hispanic and Lusophone Linguistics* 14 (1): 39-79.
- Lopes, Célia, and Sílvia Cavalcante. 2011. A Cronologia do Voceamento no Português Brasileiro: Expansão de Você-Sujeito e Retenção do Clítico-te. *Lingüística* 25: 30-65.
- Melis, Chantal, Marcela Flores, and Sergio Bogard. 2003. La Historia del Español. Propuesta de un Tercer Período Evolutivo. *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica* 51 (1): 1-56.
- Molina Martos, Isabel. 2020. Linguistic Change and Social Transformation: the Spread of tuteo in Restoration Spain and Second Republic (1875-1939). In *Address in Portuguese and Spanish. Studies in Diachrony and Diachronic Reconstruction*, ed. Martin Hummel and Célia Lopes, 443-480. Berlin, Mouton de Gruyter.
- Moreno Fernández, Francisco. 1986. Sociolingüística de los Tratamientos: Estudio Sobre la Comunidad

- Rural. Anuario de Letras: Lingüística y Filología 24: 87-120.
- O'Flanagan, Patrick. 2008. Port cities of Atlantic Iberia c. 1500-1900. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Preston, Dennis. 1999. Handbook of Perceptual Dialectology. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Raumolin-Brunberg, Helena. 2005. The Diffusion of Subject You: A Case Study in Historical Sociolinguistics. *Language Variation and Change* 17: 55-73.
- Rodríguez Molina, Javier. 2016. Patrones de Variación en la Concordancia del Participio en Español Antiguo. In *En torno a haber: construcciones, usos y variación desde el latín hasta la actualidad*, ed. Carlota De Benito and Álvaro Octavio de Toledo y Huerta, 417-467. Bern: Peter Lang.
- Ronjat, Jules. 1937. *Grammaire Historique des Parlers Provençaux Modernes*. Montpellier: Société des Langues Romanes.
- Siewierska, Anna. 2004. Person. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Vanelli, Laura. 1987. I Pronomi Soggetto nei Dialetti Italiani Settentrionali dal Medioevo ad oggi. Medioevo Romanzo 13: 173-211.
- Watts, Richard. 2003. Politeness. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press